FORT LAUDERDALE CITIZENS REVIEW BOARD MINUTES

Ft. Lauderdale Police Department City Hall – 8th Floor Conference Room 100 N. Andrews Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, Florida September 12, 2005 - 7:00 P.M.

> 1/05 - 12/05 Cumulative Attendance (Including Special Meetings)

| | | (modamig operationings) | |
|----------------------------|----------------|-------------------------|---|
| Board Members | Present/Absent | P | Α |
| Steven Muffler, Chair | Р | 9 | 0 |
| Roosevelt Walters, Vice Ch | air P | 9 | 0 |
| Fenel Antoine | Р | 8 | 1 |
| Ted Fling | Р | 9 | 0 |
| Sergeant Jan Jordan | Р | 7 | 2 |
| Officer Thor Lockhart | Р | 9 | 0 |
| Linda Shallenberger | Р | 8 | 1 |
| Captain Kevin Sheehan | Р | 7 | 2 |
| Dr. Ronald Wright | Р | 2 | 0 |

<u>Staff</u>

Sergeant John Dale, Internal Affairs Sergeant Victor London, Internal Affairs Sergeant John Labandera, Internal Affairs Sergeant William Lauginiger, Internal Affairs David Hebert, FTL Public Relations Lisa Edmondson, Recording Secretary Brenda Cooper, Recording Secretary

Guest Speakers

A. Roll Call

Chair Muffler called the meeting to order at 7:05 p.m.

B. Approve minutes from July 11, 2005

Motion made by Mr. Fling, seconded by Ms. Shallenberger, to approve the minutes of the July 11, 2005 meeting. In a voice vote, the motion passed unanimously.

C. Approve minutes from August 8, 2005

Motion made by Mr. Fling, seconded by Ms. Shallenberger, to approve the minutes of the August 8, 2005 Special meeting. In a voice vote, the motion passed unanimously. Mr. Walters asked that a comma be placed on page 4 between the names of Joy Watson and Renee Bianca-Casseus.

D. General Information

Mr. Fling asked that the memorandum of 9/2/05 from Chief Roberts with attached memorandum dated 9/1/05 from City Manager Gretsas to Officer Hoffman be included with the 8/8/05 Special

Fort Lauderdale Citizens Review Board September 12, 2005 Page 2

Meeting minutes. As the document had not been produced at the 8/8/05 meeting, it was determined it should be included in this date's meeting minutes.

Motion made by Mr. Fling, seconded by Mr. Walters, to attach the memorandum of 9/2/05 from Chief Roberts with attached memorandum dated 9/1/05 from City Manager Gretsas to Officer Hoffman to the current meeting minutes. In a voice vote, the motion passed unanimously.

Mr. Antoine commented that he is not in agreement with the City Manager's decision, asking that the Board apprise Mr. Gretsas of their difference of opinion regarding the outcome of the allegations against Officer Hoffman. Ms. Shallenberger agreed.

Mr. Walters stated that the Board can only make recommendations which they did in this case, and the matter should go no further. Chair Muffler concurred.

Motion made by Mr. Antoine, seconded by Ms. Shallenberger, to address correspondence to the City Manager expressing their disapproval of his decision. In a roll call vote as follows, the motion failed: Ms. Shallenberger, yes; Capt. Sheehan, no; Mr. Antoine, yes; Officer Lockhart, no; Sgt. Jordan, no; Mr. Fling, no; Dr. Wright, no; Vice Chair Walters, no; and Chair Muffler, no.

E. Discussion

- 1) Televised Board Meetings
- 2) Status Citizen Review Board proposed name change

Chair Muffler stated that, with regard to a public record report on the police generated by an outside agency provided by him at a previous meeting, this matter has been withdrawn as the City Attorney's Office felt discussion of same was beyond the scope of the Board's authority.

Mr. Fling asked for an update on the status of the 5/12/05 Board recommendation to the City Manager regarding Officer Kowalski, as well as the 7/15/05 correspondence regarding Officer Mauro as there has been no response. Chair Muffler pointed out that the City Manager is not required to respond to the Board, however, a followup inquiry can be sent. Ms. Shallenberger noted that a second request had also been sent to the City Manager asking for a reply.

With regard to televised Board meetings, Chair Muffler advised that this was not going to take place and the item should be removed from future agendas.

No further action has been taken in regard to changing the name of the Board as this issue is pending before the City Commission while waiting for a formal draft of proposed code revisions. At the request of the City Clerk, Chair Muffler redrafted the provisions and sent them to the Clerk. After not receiving a response, Chair Muffler states he went to the City Attorney's office asking what else needs to be done and was advised they were "working on it." At this point, he is not sure of the status.

Mr. Fling requested that the Board's stationery be similar to other City Boards which lists the names of the members under letterhead naming the Board. He was advised this is pending formalization of the Board's name change.

F. Review the following Internal Affairs investigation:

1. Complainant: Officer Crystal Brignoni (I.A. #05-017)

Allegations: Employee Harassment
Officer: Sergeant Harvey Jacques

Disposition: Unfounded

Chair Muffler announced the case and stated that Officer Brignoni was not present.

Mr. Fling wondered why Officer McCarthy, who was mentioned in the statement taken from Officer Brignoni, had not been interviewed during the investigation. Capt. Sheehan stated the name should have been McCarsky, not McCarthy. Mr. Fling also questioned Officer Brignoni's emotional stability. Capt. Sheehan agreed she is emotional over this issue, but he did not believe she had other problems, citing it was probably just a personality conflict which has been resolved now that the officers have been reassigned.

Motion made by Mr. Walters, seconded by Ms. Shallenberger, to accept the findings and recommendations of Internal Affairs. In a voice vote, the motion passed unanimously.

2. Complainant: Bruce G. Roberts, Chief (I.A. #05-079)

Allegations: Use of Deadly Force

Officer: Stevens Gelu Disposition: Exonerated

Chair Muffler announced this case and stated that Officer Gelu was not present.

Capt. Sheehan noted that Officer Gelu had been cleared to return to full duty, and is attending specialized schooling acquiring more firearms training.

Motion made by Mr. Walters, seconded by Mr. Fling, to accept the findings and recommendations of Internal Affairs. In a voice vote, the motion passed unanimously.

There being no further business before this Board, and upon motion duly made and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 7:45 p.m.